



Planning Commission Agenda Item Staff Report

CITY OF SAN BRUNO

DATE: February 15, 2022

TO: Planning Commission

FROM: Pamela Wu, Director

PREPARED BY: Brandon Wofford, Assistant Planner

SUBJECT: 1261 Claremont Drive (APN: 019-014-040)
Zoning: R-1 (Single-Family Residential) Recommended
Environmental Determination: Categorical Exemption pursuant to Class 1, Section 15301.e.(2): Existing Facilities.

Request for an Architectural Review Permit to allow a residential addition that would increase the overall floor area of the single-family residence by more than one thousand square feet and which would be greater than three thousand square feet, pursuant to Section 12.200.070 of the San Bruno Municipal Code; and for a Use Permit to allow a residential addition that would exceed the existing floor area by more than fifty percent pursuant to SBMC Section 12.200.030 (B.1). Kevin Lee (Owner), Brian Wong (Architect).

UP21-012, AR21-013

BACKGROUND:

The subject lot measures 6,440 square feet and currently consists of a single-family home with an attached two-car garage. The subject property is located on the northwest corner of Claremont Drive and Fairmont Drive, in the Crestmoor Park No. 2 subdivision which was initially subdivided in 1955. The homes in the immediate vicinity were built between 1956 and 1957. The current home includes three bedrooms and two bathrooms with 1,857 square feet of gross floor area. The neighborhood that surrounds the subject property shares similar architectural building style, as they were developed at roughly the same time.

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION:

- **Easements:** A small section of a Public Utility Easement (PUE) crosses the northeast corner of the property with an attached 2 foot by 20 foot anchor easement.
- **Code enforcement:** There are no known Code Enforcement cases for this property.
- **Heritage trees:** There are no trees proposed to be removed for this project.

SURROUNDING LAND USES:

North: Plymouth Way – R-1 (Single Family Residential), single family homes
South: Fairmont Drive – R-1 (Single Family Residential), single family homes
East: Hampton Court – R-1 (Single Family Residential), single family homes
West: Glenview Drive – R-1 (Single Family Residential), single family homes

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE (ARC):

The Architectural Review Committee originally reviewed the project on November 4, 2021 at its regular public meeting. The original design contained many elements which were not in compliance with the *San Bruno Residential Design Guidelines*, which are highlighted in the Discussion section below. The members of the Architectural Review Committee instructed the applicant to redesign various elements of the proposed home and bring the project back to a subsequent meeting. In addition, numerous public comments were received from neighbors and community members who expressed concern with the design of the home, size and scale of the addition and potential privacy and shade/shadow impacts to adjoining properties. Concern was expressed about the design's departure from numerous aesthetics of the surrounding neighborhood.

The ARC (Durazo, Johnson, Madden) subsequently re-reviewed the project on January 13, 2022. The architect provided two design options with minor detail changes in the patio covering (one with an open canopy design and one with a solid roof patio). The architect also suggested two different color schemes for the exterior materials of the home. There was extensive conversation about the various styles of windows utilized in the project and their inconsistencies. The Commissioners requested that the plate heights of the addition be lowered. They also asked that the architect provide renderings of the proposed home and finalized plans with one definitive choice of the aforementioned options provided.

After receiving the staff report, the ARC forwarded the Architectural Review Permit and the Use Permit for approval (3-0) to the Planning Commission with the requests listed above.

LEGAL NOTICE:

Notices of public hearing were mailed to owners of property within 300 feet on February 4, 2022. A Notice of Public Hearing was published in the San Mateo Daily Journal.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Letter(s) received as public comment will be included with this packet as Attachment 6.

DISCUSSION:

The proposed project includes a 116 square foot addition to the first floor and a new second floor addition of 1,157 square feet. The total proposed addition is 1,273 square feet which would increase the existing house from 1,857 square feet to 3,130 square feet. The proposed first floor would include an expanded kitchen and dining room with a new bedroom, bathroom and foyer. The proposed second story addition would consist of a primary bedroom and bathroom. The entire home would include four bedrooms and three bathrooms. The existing two-car garage will remain. The project utilizes materials which comply with the *San Bruno Residential Design Guidelines*.

PROJECT DETAILS SUMMARY:

SITE CONDITIONS		ZONING REQUIREMENTS	EXISTING CONDITIONS	PROPOSED CONDITIONS
Land Use (Zoning District) <i>SBMC 12.96.060</i>		R-1, Single Family Residential		
Lot Area		6,440 square feet		
Adjustment Factor <i>SBMC 12.96.060(D.7)</i>		0.91		
Adjusted Lot Area <i>SBMC 12.96.060(D.7)</i>		5,860 square feet		
Floor Area Ratio <i>SBMC 12.96.060(D.7)</i>		.55 (For Adjusted Lot Area)	.32	.53
Gross Floor Area <i>SBMC 12.96.060(D.7)</i>		3,223 sq. ft.	1,857 sq. ft.	3,130 sq. ft.
Lot Coverage <i>SBMC 12.96.060(D.3)</i>		2,578 sq. ft. 80% of Gross Floor Area	1,857 sq. ft.	2,069 sq. ft.
Impermeable Area <i>SBMC 12.96.060(D.4)</i>		5,152 sq. ft. R-1: 80% of Lot Area	3,755 sq. ft.	3,975 sq. ft.
Building Setbacks <i>SBMC 12.96.060 (D.7)</i>	Front (North)	15 ft. (to property line) / 20 ft. (garage to sidewalk)	17 ft. (to property line) / 23 ft. (garage to sidewalk)	17 ft. (to property line) / 23 ft. (garage to sidewalk)
	Rear (South)	10 ft.	14 ft., 11 in.	14 ft., 11 in.
	Right Side (West)	5 ft.	4 ft., 1 in.	4 ft., 1 in.
	Left Side (East)	5 ft.	5 ft.	5 ft.
Building Height <i>SBMC 12.96.670(D.8)</i>		28 ft.	15 ft., 3 in.	26 ft., 7 in.
Parking Spaces <i>SBMC 12.100.030</i>		2 covered	2 covered	2 covered

SQUARE FOOTAGE BREAKDOWN:

	First Floor	Second Floor	Garage	Total
Existing Floor Area	1,450 sq. ft.	N/A	407 sq. ft.	1,857 sq. ft.
Proposed Additions	+ 116 sq. ft.	+ 1,157 sq. ft.	-	1,273 sq. ft.
Proposed Total Floor Area	1,973 sq. ft.	1,157 sq. ft.	407 sq. ft.	3,130 sq. ft.

STAFF'S PROJECT ANALYSIS:

UP21-012: Increase the existing floor area by greater than fifty percent: Pursuant to Section 12.200.030, B2, the project requires a Use Permit because it proposes to increase the existing floor area of the home by greater than fifty percent. The proposed addition of 1,273 square feet to a home of 1,857 square feet is an increase of sixty-nine percent. The Use Permit reviews and analyses if the proposed new construction would be compatible with the existing neighborhood character and scale.

AR21-013: Architectural Review Permit: Pursuant to the City's Municipal Code Section 12.200.070, an Architectural Review Permit is required for a residential addition that would increase the floor area by more than one thousand square feet and greater than three thousand square feet.

Despite the increase in floor area, the proposed additions do not exceed the maximum allowable floor area nor the maximum lot coverage. The proposed additions will maintain all current setbacks for the front, rear, and both sides. The proposed exterior materials include stucco and cement siding in both horizontal and vertical directions.

San Bruno Residential Design Guidelines

The *San Bruno Residential Design Guidelines* recommends any new second story construction to either meet the daylight plane requirement or to add façade articulation through step backs, roof overhangs or window treatments. By doing so, privacy concerns imposed to adjacent properties can be adequately mitigated. The proposed project has satisfied both requirements. The daylight plane requirement is met in three out of the four sides of the home (only two are required). In addition, numerous façade articulations and architectural design elements have been provided, including variations in wall planes with step backs, insets, and pop-outs.

In its first review by the Architectural Review Committee, the original proposal had several areas in which it departed from recommendations of the *San Bruno Residential Design Guidelines* (SBRDG). The Architectural Review Committee instructed the applicant to redesign the project to be in compliance with the guidelines. After the second ARC review, the applicant submitted revised plans which:

- Lower the ceiling height of the addition to 9'4" on the first floor and 7'-9" for the second floor side wall, for an overall height of 25'-7" (original height was 26'-11"). The lowering of the second story puts the addition more in proportion to the existing house.
- Show consistent window treatments for all the windows.
- Include only clearstory windows on the north side elevation to address privacy concerns to the neighboring property owner.
- Show the wrap around porch detail.
- Include renderings which show representative color use.

Both the applicant and owner worked with Staff and the ARC to address the design discrepancies, as follows:

- **SBRDG 3.1 Neighborhood compatibility:** The original proposal significantly differed from the both the character and scale of its immediate neighborhood with a much larger mass and more modern elements. The applicant resolved this by changing modern elements to be more aligned with the surrounding neighborhood which is more traditional and ranch style in nature. In addition, improvements were made which contributed to the appearance of the overall mass, such as resizing the front door and windows. In addition, the overall height of the addition has been lowered by 16”.
- **SBRDG 3.4 Architectural style:** The proposed project used a mix of elements from different architectural styles. The applicant removed the contemporary rectangular stair tower and its associated side wall which differed significantly from the ranch style of the rest of the house and those in the surrounding neighborhood. In addition, the applicant changed many of the windows to be more standard sizes.
- **SBRDG 3.5.2 Use roof types similar to those in the neighborhood:** The originally proposed rectangular stair tower and its associated flat roof line along the east elevation were not consistent with the sloped hip style roof form found throughout the surrounding neighborhood. In the resubmittal, the stair tower and flat roof line were brought under the roof line and was reduced in size to be in conformance.
- **SBRDG 3.7 Entries:** The original proposal included a large, projecting entry, which the applicant redesigned to be recessed and under the roof eaves to be similar to the surrounding ranch-style homes.
- **SBRDG 3.8 Doors and windows:** The original project proposed several different styles of windows which were not consistent nor found throughout the surrounding homes. The applicant redesigned many of the front and side windows to be smaller and match with each other and be more in scale with the window sizes found on the existing house and in the neighborhood.
- **SBRDG 3.9 Materials and colors:** The originally proposed black steam metal roofing was markedly different than roofs in the surrounding area, which are predominately composed of composite shingles in muted colors. The applicant adjusted the design to utilize a shingle roof which matches the others homes in the neighborhood.

Staff believes that the revised plans address the areas of design inconsistency with the design guidelines.

Use Permit Findings – SBMC Section 12.112.050.B

1. Will not under the circumstances of the particular case, be detrimental to the health, safety, morals, comfort and general welfare of the persons residing or working in the neighborhood of such proposed use. (SBMC 12.112.050.B.1)

The project has been adequately reviewed and conditioned to ensure that the home will be constructed according to the California Building Code (CBC) and will not be

detrimental to the health, safety and general welfare of the persons residing in the neighborhood.

2. Will not be injurious or detrimental to property and improvement in the neighborhood or to the general welfare of the city. (SBMC 12.112.050.B.2)

The proposed new construction and materials are consistent with the existing structure and comply with the elements of the San Bruno Residential Design Guidelines and therefore the project will not be detrimental to property and improvement in the neighborhood or to the general welfare of the City.

3. That the proposed development is consistent with the San Bruno General Plan. (SBMC 12.108.050.B.3)

The San Bruno General Plan designates the property as a Low-Density Residential district and allows the establishment of a single-family residence. The development of a single-family dwelling is consistent with the General Plan designation.

Architectural Review Permit Findings

1. That the proposed development, as set forth on the plans, will not unreasonably restrict or interfere with light and air on the property and on other property in the neighborhood, will not hinder or discourage the appropriate development and use of land and buildings in the neighborhood, or impair the value thereof; and is consistent with the design and scale of the neighborhood. (SBMC 12.108.040.D).

The *San Bruno Residential Design Guidelines* recommends second stories to either meet the daylight plane requirement or add façade articulation through step backs, roof overhangs and window treatments, to help minimize privacy concerns and avoid blank wall façades. The proposed project utilizes varied step backs, insets, roof overhangs, varied roof lines, material changes, and other design elements as façade articulation features. The new construction maintains all current setbacks. Due to these reasons, the project would not unreasonably restrict or interfere with light and air on the adjacent properties.

2. That the general appearance of the proposed building, structure, or grounds will be in keeping with the character of the neighborhood, will not be detrimental to the orderly and harmonious development of the city, and will not impair the desirability of investment or occupation in the neighborhood. (SBMC 12.108.040.G).

Despite the home's proposed increase in size, the applicant has utilized elements to help the home fit into the character of the neighborhood. The project is both well-designed, so it will not impair the desirability of investment or occupation in the neighborhood.

3. That any proposed single-family or two-family dwelling conform to the basic design principles of the residential design guidelines as adopted by resolution by the city council and as may be revised from time to time. (SBMC 12.108.040.I).

Staff finds that the proposed building conforms to the design principles of the *San Bruno Residential Design Guidelines*. The *San Bruno Residential Design Guidelines* recommends respecting the predominant materials and character of the neighborhood while designing homes with architectural identity and integrity. The applicant is proposing to utilize the similar materials as the existing single-family home to remain in conformance with the *San Bruno Residential Design Guidelines*.

FISCAL IMPACT: There is no fiscal impact.

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT:

This project qualifies for the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Exemption Class 1, Section 15301.e.(2) (A): Existing Facilities, where the addition will not result in an increase of more 10,000 square feet and the project is located in an area where all public services and facilities are available to allow for maximum development permissible in the General Plan.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission approve Use Permit UP21-012 and Architectural Review Permit AR21-013 based on Findings 1-6 and Conditions of Approval 1-23.

NEXT STEPS:

The Planning Commission is the final approval body for this project. If approved, there is a 10-day appeal period from the date of the Planning Commission's final action. Appeals shall be made in writing and filed with the City Clerk within ten days after the final action of the Planning Commission and as described in Section 12.140.020 of the San Bruno Municipal Code. The Use Permit will expire if a building permit for the approved project is not issued within two years on February 15, 2024 per SBMC Section 12.128.010.

ALTERNATIVES:

1. Request that the applicant make certain modifications to the Use Permit UP21-013 and Architectural Review Permit AR21-015 and bring it back to a subsequent meeting of the Planning Commission.
2. Deny the Use Permit UP21-013 and Architectural Review Permit AR21-015 with Findings.

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Preliminary Conditions of Approval
2. Site Location
3. Photographs
4. Renderings
5. Site Plan, Floor Plans, and Elevations
6. Public Comment Letter(s)