



City Council Agenda Item Staff Report

CITY OF SAN BRUNO

DATE: May 9, 2023

TO: Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council

FROM: Alex D. McIntyre, Interim City Manager

PREPARED BY: Ryan Johansen, Chief of Police
Jennifer Dianos, Assistant to the City Manager

SUBJECT: Consider Adoption of Resolution:

1. Approving the Special Event Permit With the Temporary Road Closure of Various Streets in Conjunction With the Annual Posy Parade Subject to Conditions of Approval
2. Approving the Waiver of City Fees/Costs for the Development and Implementation of a Traffic Control and Event Safety Plan and Incident Action Plan for the Event in the Total Amount of up to \$96,938.23
3. Appropriating \$96,938.23 From the General Fund Reserve in the Fiscal Year 2022-23 Operating Budget

BACKGROUND:

The City of San Bruno received a Special Event application from the San Bruno Lions Club (Lions Club) for their annual Posy Parade (Event). In 2023, the Posy Parade will be in its 81st year of existence in San Bruno. The Posy Parade is a long-standing tradition held on the first Sunday in June, showcasing the youth of the San Bruno community. Over the last 80 years, youth organizations and local San Bruno schools have worked together to create a parade with floats and local school marching bands.

The Special Event process is a new process for this event, and City staff worked with members of the Lions Club to align the event with the City of San Bruno [Municipal Code Chapter 4.08](#)¹ titled Dance and Entertainment Events. The Posy Parade is planned, organized and delivered by the Lions Club. The City of San Bruno has coordinated with the Lions Club each year in an effort to deliver a fun and safe parade. The traditional historic route of the Parade has been along San Mateo Avenue and up Crystal Springs Road ending in San Bruno City Park where baseball games and festivities are held. City staff met with members of the Lions Club early in the process to discuss the requirements of the parade route and other components required to hold a large community event.

¹ https://library.gcode.us/lib/san_bruno_ca/pub/municipal_code/item/title_4-chapter_4_08?view=all

For several prior years, the City and the Lions Club have coordinated the Posy Parade and the City's Community Day, in a joint effort to provide the local community a fun-filled day of a parade, games, art, rides, food and more. Last year, the Posy Parade used San Mateo Avenue from Angus Avenue to El Camino Real in collaboration with the City's Community Day. This stretch of roadway is in a commercial area where there is only on-street vehicle parking. With the posting of no parking/tow away signs prior to the event, all vehicles can be cleared from the parade route. A Traffic Control and Event Safety Plan (Plan) was developed by the Police Department, with input from the City's Public Works Department including the Traffic Engineer. Implementation of the Plan is proposed to be facilitated through a joint effort of the Police Department and the City's Public Works Department, using vehicles and rented concrete barriers to secure the perimeter of the parade route. In years past, the Plan did not follow industry standards and identified best practices, leaving several areas of the parade route vulnerable to a vehicle, deliberately or otherwise, entering the route and harm pedestrians who are using the roadway for the parade. This vulnerability was created by the use of Type 3 barricades at several of the closure points that provide no physical barrier to prevent a vehicle from passing. The industry standards and identified best practices for parades includes placing vehicle resistant barriers along the entirety of the parade and then clearing the secured route of all vehicles.

Due to the new Recreation and Aquatic Center Project construction in 2022, the City was unable to hold Community Day in San Bruno City Park and moved the event to San Mateo Avenue. Given the challenges with holding two large community events on the same day and time, the City decided to postpone the planning of Community Day for 2023.

In order to follow current safety standards for the parade route, City staff worked extensively with the Lions Club over the last several months on considering an alternative parade route for participants to not have to cross State Route 82-El Camino Real (ECR), which has eight travel lanes and a high volume of vehicle traffic. In addition, City staff highlighted the requirement of ensuring adequate safety measures in order to remain in compliance with the Manual on Uniform Traffic Control Devices (MUTCD) standards, as well as industry best practices for protecting parade participants from potential harm caused by vehicles. In the previous 12 months, there have been at least nine known incidents in the United States in which parade participants were harmed by vehicles due to substandard safety practices by the local jurisdiction. It is imperative that the City take all necessary precautions to protect the many residents, most of whom are children, who participate in this parade. The Lions Club does not possess the expertise to provide the required Traffic Control and Event Safety Plan, and indicated to staff that it did not have the financial capability to have it completed by consultants. The Lions Club requested that the City assist in this effort to ensure that the parade could continue, which City staff immediately stepped in to do.

Other services that the City provides in order to hold a large community event include parking enforcement, traffic control, opening and closing of intersections, noticing of street closures, event security, post event clean-up, community outreach, and Fire Department support for fire and rescue and emergency medical services. The City has provided services in the past, with the coordination of the two events (Posy Parade and Community Day).

Attached to this report is an excerpt titled "The Posy Parade: A Unique Tradition" from the [La Peninsula: The Journal of the San Mateo County Historical Association, volume xlii, No.2²](#), which provides additional historical relevance of the Posy Parade to the San Bruno community.

DISCUSSION:

The City provides critical logistical and operational support for the Posy Parade each year to support the Lions Club in the delivery of this important community event. The San Bruno Lions Posy Parade is scheduled for Sunday, June 4, 2023 from 11:00 a.m. to 1:00 p.m. Parades and other community events that make use of the public rights-of-way have been more scrutinized after numerous tragic events worldwide where vehicles have entered closed event areas. This includes at least nine such occurrences in the United States in just the 12 months leading up to this Staff Report. It is important to note that not all of these incidents involve malicious acts as many of them were simply tragic accidents that could have been avoided with proper planning and precautions. Any event that knowingly places pedestrians onto a roadway that is normally restricted to vehicular use creates tremendous liability for the City. Proper planning, consistent with lessons learned from prior tragedies, is absolutely essential to protect human life, as well as the financial viability of the City.

The Lions Club requested the City assist with the development of the Traffic Control and Safety Plan, and to consider the waiver of costs associated with the development and implementation of the Plan as well as the costs associated with the Special Event Application Fee.

As stipulated in Municipal Code Chapter 4.08, the Chief of Police shall impose conditions and requirements upon the issuance of the permit as deemed necessary in order to protect and preserve the safety of the persons attending the event and the peace and quiet of the neighborhood in which the event is being held.

Section 4.08.050 provides that the Chief of Police shall make all necessary arrangements with the applicant for the presence of a sufficient number of either off-duty police officers, security guards, or both, as determined by the Chief of Police, who shall be required to be present during the event. The costs of the presence of any such personnel shall be paid by the applicant. In addition, the Chief of Police may deny the application if he or she makes any determination that the proposed event would be contrary to the public safety, health, or welfare and could not be mitigated by reasonable conditions which might be imposed by the Chief of Police.

At the request of the Lions Club, the Police Department has developed a Traffic Control and Safety Plan for the proposed event, which meets the above-described conditions for approval by our Chief of Police.

Security Concerns

From 2022 to 2023, there have been a combined twenty (20) injuries and zero (0) deaths at similar events. A deeper analysis of these events and the driver's motivation has revealed that in only one case it was determined to be an "intentional act," but all the others were a

² <https://historysmc.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/La-Peninsula-San-Bruno-Summer-2014.pdf>

combination of confused drivers, drivers under the influence, or a driver wanting to leave or return to their residence which was inside the closure.

In three of the events, security measures in place prevented countless additional injured participants. In all the cases, a vehicle unexpectedly entering the parade route caused mass panic. These events have changed the way public safety looks at the way street closures can be safely achieved.

There has also been a change in best practices when looking at parade pre-planning and selection of a parade route, to use current environmental and street conditions to assist with providing safety to the attendees of the event.

Proposed Parade Route

For 2023, the updated parade route is proposed to be on Linden Avenue, from Angus Avenue to Crystal Springs Road and then on Crystal Springs Road to San Bruno City Park. This identified route traverses mostly residential neighborhood streets, avoids crossing ECR but adds additional hazards to mitigate.

The additional hazards come in the unknown number of vehicles parked in private driveways or garages along the parade route. These vehicles cannot be legally removed from inside the closure area and while there will be security components along the parade route, there would be nothing physically preventing a vehicle from leaving their driveway and traversing the closed parade route.

This route also crosses more intersections than years prior as the route is longer. To analyze the approximate cost, a draft Plan was developed by the Police Department with assistance from Public Works. As proposed, this Plan for the Posy Parade route will have a staging area on Angus Avenue from Elm Avenue to Linden Avenue and from Elm Avenue and Linden Avenue to the rear of San Bruno City Hall.

Traffic Control and Event Safety Plan

The proposed parade route map is attached to this staff report.

The proposed Plan requires 15 separate traffic posts. Many are unstaffed and require K-rails, Type-3 barricades, signage and/or traffic cones. Some of the posts are staffed and require vehicles to be used as a movable barrier. The Plan relies extensively on K-rails and vehicles to provide risk mitigation for this pre-planned event.

Option 1. Estimated Costs with City Staff Providing Full Implementation of the Traffic Control and Event Safety Plan and the Incident Action Plan

- a. The estimated costs for the Police Department with assistance from Public Works to create the MUTCD-compliant Plan for this event with drafting, edits, revisions, and coordination would be \$2,400.
- b. The estimated costs for Public Works to support this event with staff hours, K-rail rentals and delivery, forklift rentals, creating and posting signage 72 hours prior to the event, advance

notification to affected residents and businesses, etc. are \$67,238.23. It should be noted that Public Works would normally require a minimum of 30 days advance notice to formally plan and procure additional signage and K-rails. Public Works has preliminarily inquired with vendor United Rentals and the vendor has already stated they may not be able to supply the currently estimated required 44 K-rails.

- c. The Police Department would be able to plan and create an Incident Action Plan and provide the estimated 25 staff members and 14 vehicles for this event at an estimated cost of \$27,300. It should be noted that estimated vehicle operational costs were not factored into this estimate.

Total Estimated Cost for Option 1: \$96,938.23

Option 2. Estimated Costs with BATS Traffic Solutions Providing Street Closures and the City Police Department Providing the Incident Action Plan

- a. The estimated costs for BATS Traffic Solutions to create a MUTCD-compliant Traffic Control Plan for this event with drafting, edits, revisions and coordination would be \$2,100.
- b. The estimated costs for BATS Traffic Solutions to support this event with staff hours, K-rail rentals, forklift rentals, creating and posting signage 72 hours prior to the event, etc. are \$56,478.50. It should be noted that BATS Traffic Solutions will not do any pre-closure public outreach.
- c. The Police Department would be able to plan, create an Incident Action Plan and provide the estimated 25 staff members and 14 vehicles for this event at an estimated cost of \$27,300. It should be noted that estimated vehicle operational costs were not factored into this estimate.

Total Estimated Cost for Option 2: \$85,875.50

Staff recommends the City Council approve Option 1, as it will provide for the highest level of City involvement and direct control of implementation of the Traffic Control and Event Safety Plan to ensure safety for the community.

Special Event Permit Application Fee

Per the City of San Bruno's Fiscal Year 2022-23 [Master Fee Schedule](#)³, the cost for applying for a Special Event Permit includes the actual cost of staff and/or consultant time to review the application and coordinate with the applicant. Typically, this would require a deposit to be made at the time of application submittal. A deposit was not collected from the Lions Club. The estimated cost for the review and processing of the special event application is \$7,500, which includes, but is not limited to, internal staff coordination and review of the application, meeting with the applicants, and the processing of material associated with the event, including this report to the City Council for consideration. This cost has not been included in the fee waiver amount, as the staff time expended can be absorbed through the Fiscal Year (FY) 2022-23 Operating Budget within department operating budget.

³ <https://www.sanbruno.ca.gov/ArchiveCenter/ViewFile/Item/154>

FISCAL IMPACT:

The City of San Bruno FY 2022-23 Operating Budget does not include any appropriations for this special event as it is not a City event. Should City Council consider approving the event and closures for the Posy Parade utilizing Option 1 presented in this report with City staff providing full implementation for the Event Traffic Control and Event Safety Plan and the Incident Action Plan, an allocation of \$96,938.23 would require City Council action. The resolution attached to this report allows the City Council to consider and approve the amount appropriated from the General Fund Reserve Fund. There are currently sufficient funds to cover this amount in the General Fund Reserve Fund. Other costs associated with the event, such as community outreach, and Fire Department support for fire and rescue and emergency medical services will be absorbed through the FY 2022-23 Operating Budget within department operating budget.

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT:

The action is not a project subject to CEQA. City Council's action is not considered a "Project" per CEQA Guidelines and therefore no further environmental analysis is required.

RECOMMENDATION:

Consider Adoption of Resolution:

1. Approving the Special Event Permit with the Temporary Road Closure of Various Streets in Conjunction with the Annual Posy Parade Subject to Conditions of Approval
2. Approving the Waiver of City Fees and Costs for the Development and Implementation of a Traffic Control and Safety Plan and Incident Action Plan for the Event in the Total Amount of up to \$96,938.23
3. Appropriating \$96,938.23 from the General Fund Reserve in the Fiscal Year 2022-23 Operating Budget

ALTERNATIVES:

1. Do not approve the Special Event Permit and Road Closures for the Posy Parade.
2. Do not approve the waiver of City Costs/Fees associated with the Posy Parade.
3. Provide direction to staff regarding City participation and support to the Posy Parade.

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Resolution
2. Proposed Parade Route
3. "The Posy Parade: A Unique Tradition" from the [La Peninsula: The Journal of the San Mateo County Historical Association, volume xlii, No.2](#)